HOSPTIALITY, CULINARY & TOURISM MANAGEMENT

Summary of Program Review:

A.   Major Findings

  1.   Strengths:

<u>**72.9% Increase in Program Enrollment**</u> (classes taken). In context this works out to be 64.2% increase in actual headcount.

Transition to fully credited Culinary Arts program completed since last P.R.:

> HCTM-190 Culinary Internship 1: Spring 2022
> HCTM-250 Advanced Culinary Arts: Spring 2023
> HCTM-290 Culinary Internship 2: Fall 2023

<u>**Tuition Reduction in Culinary Arts Program.**</u> The transition of fee-based culinary arts classes to credit, has reduced students' tuition cost by 85.46%. In dollars, fees were $20,000 for old NVCS program, now $2907 for a COA in Culinary Arts. This is combined credits and student fees costs. See end of section IV for Excel break down.

<u>**Program-Level Retention & Successful Course Completion Rates**</u> 2021-2022 through 2023-2024 show that HCTM has a 98% Retention Rate and a 79.8% successful course completion rate.

Higher Rates of service of disproportionately effected groups, than the Institute as a whole.

> **19 or Younger**: **82.7%. <u>+11.6%</u>** higher than the institute
> **African American/Black**: **83.0%**: <u>**+14.8%**</u> higher than the institute
> **Latinx/Hispanic: 80.1% <u>+10.7%</u>** higher than the institute
> **First-Generation**:**76.7% <u>+7.3%</u>** higher than the institute

  2.   Areas for Improvement:

<u>**Culinary Arts needs new Teaching Kitchen**</u>. The UVC is no longer a viable option, due to infrastructure issues with HVAC, electrical, IT, phone service and lack of personnel support. The lack of working HVAC and phone service leaves the space illegal to run classes. Additionally, it has become an equity and economic burden for students, having to drive an extra 40-60 minutes (one way) north, for classes. The majority of our students come from the City of Napa, American Canyon and Solano County, with some not having cars or drivers licenses. **900-Kitchen Main Campus** is a converted cafeteria kitchen that has severe plumbing issues, that are Health Department compliance level problems. The electrical needs updating and there are safety issues with a lack of line of sight, for overseeing students through out the kitchen.

<u>**Full Time Instructional Aide**</u> needed to help monitor students in 900-Kitchen. There is no direct line of sight in the space, now our only teaching kitchen space. Students and Instructors need support with the use of knives and hot cooking equipment.

<u>**Need another Full-time instructor**</u>, to help with overall enrollment growth, the launch of HCTM-255 Advanced Baking & Pastry(12 credits) and the load issues with potential twice yearly running of HCTM-250 Advanced Culinary(12 credits).

<u>**Need For Additional Marketing For**</u> <u>**HCTM-120 Intro to Hospitality Management**</u> to support the largest, private industry in the Napa Valley. HCTM-120 needs enrollment boosting, having decreased by 33.9% between 2021-2024.

<u>**Need For Additional Marketing For HCTM-122 Principles in Hotel Management**</u> to support the largest, private industry in the Napa Valley. HCTM-122 needs enrollment boosting, having decreased by 35.7% between 2021-2024.

-**HCTM-200 & 201, HOSPNC-600, 601 and 602**: Forbes Luxury Training and Non-Credit Hosp. Management classes **will be archived**. None having not been run since 2020. 200 & 201 were pre-pandemic training with now obsolete curriculum. The efforts made to offer them, have resulted in too small of enrollment numbers to be able to run. 600, 601 and 602 were SBDC classes, that no longer have the infrastructure or staff to run. Nor did they seem to have any traction on enrollment.

3. Projected Program Growth, Stability, or Viability:

Growth!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!
The numbers speak for themsleves. This after declines in both HCTM programs and NVCS fee-based classes.

B. Program's Support of Institutional Mission and Goals

    1. Description of Alignment between Program and Institutional Mission:

In keeping with NVC's Mission Statement of "…transforms lives" and "…to pursue a career, or to explore your interests, Napa Valley College provides excellent educational and professional opportunities that are student-centered 1, equity-focused 2, and community-oriented 3."; the HCTM program works closely with local educational institutions and industry leaders to equip our students with skills and resources for their college and professional growth. With the training they have received, the students of HCTM program have shown marketability of their skills, translating into an extremely high rate of demand for employment within the Hospitality and Culinary fields. According to the 2022 Career & Technical Education Employment Outcomes Survey, students from HCTM will get an average of 87% pay increase after completing their degrees and certificate training from our department.

    2. Assessment of Program's Recent Contributions to Institutional Mission:

In focusing on being "student centered" and " equity focused" HCTM Department members stay active through staff training, to help uphold standards of equity, inclusion and diversity. They include participation in trainings such as CRP, Safe Space and DE programs, to help keep curriculum up to date. This work is reflected by the fact that both Hospitality Management and Culinary Arts programs have students of varying ages, backgrounds and ethnic make-up. HCTM staff has worked extensively with outreach, to encourage all learners that they can take our classes, in order to find their own personal successes.

    3. Recent Program Activities Promoting the Goals of the Institutional Strategic Plan and Other Institutional Plans/Initiatives:

A key to the increased enrollment in HCTM has been the partnering, through CCAP with the following High Schools: New Technology HS-Napa, Camille Creek HS-Napa, American Canyon HS-American Canyon, Vintage HS-Napa, St. Helena HS-St. Helena, Calistoga HS-Calistoga. This list represents 31% CCAP and Dual Enrollment, and overall 5% of all NVC's enrollment.

C. New Objectives/Goals:

-With a new second kitchen, it's the goal to launch HCTM-255 Advanced Baking & Pastry in 2026. This was delayed by the shutting down of the UVC Culinary Building operations.
-Summer 2025 first run of Winery-Chef class, being first class to bridge VWT and HCTM into the same class.
-2025 to 2026: to get approval of a Winery Chef COA, combing both culinary and VWT classes.
        HCTM-100 Sanitation and Safety
        HCTM-110 Introduction to Professional Culinary Arts & Kitchen Operations
        HCTM-112 Garde Manger: Intermediate Professional Culinary Cookery
        HCTM- 210 Winery Chef
        VWT-173 Sensory Evaluation of Wine And/or VWT-150- The Wines of the Napa Valley.
-To hire a FT Teaching Kitchen Manager to over see kitchen operations and assist with support of Food & Wine Enthusiast classes. FEW classes give students training in the actual teaching of culinary classes. This is an opportunity for students to get hand-on teaching experiences themselves, as a potential career path. Having a manager to oversee the execution of these classes is key to their success, for credit side students and our community based students.

-To hire a FT Pastry Chef to take lead on HCTM-255.

-To increase marketing outreach for increase in enrollment of HCTM-120 Introduction to Hospitality Management and HCTM-122 Principles of Hotel Management.

-Continue offering BUSI-103 as a substitute for HCTM-124 Hospitality Law, when applicable.

-To increase overall enrollment of the HCTM Department to "Stability' at next Program Review cycle in 2027.

D. Description of Process Used to Ensure "Inclusive Program Review"

All members of HCTM have gotten a draft copy of this report, to add their own thoughts and findings. We meet and speak to each other on a regular basis, in order to review the semester's successes and deficiencies, in all areas. Sharing information regularly, helps us to improve our performances, giving our students the best possible engagement. This includes all of us reviewing each other's course shells in Canvas, in order to share teaching practices, as well as testing recipes and having post class meetings, to discuss what was successful or what might need improvement. All instructors in HCTM are given academic freedom, to teach in the most comfortable and inclusive ways possible.

This report covers the following program, degrees, certificates, area(s) of study, and courses (based on the Taxonomy of Programs on file with the Office of Academic Affairs):

Program	Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management
Degrees/Certificates	Hospitality Management: AS-T
	Culinary Arts Professional: AA
	Hospitality Management: CoA
	Introductory Basic Culinary Skills: SC
	Culinary Arts Advanced: CoA
	Intermediate Basic Culinary Skills: SC
Courses	HCTM 100
	HCTM 110
	HCTM 111
	HCTM 112
	HCTM 120
	HCTM 121
	HCTM 122
	HCTM 124
	HCTM 125
	HCTM 126
	HCTM 190
	HCTM 200
	HCTM 201
	HCTM 250
	HCTM 290
	HOSPNC-600
	HOSPNC-601
	HOSPNC-602

Taxonomy of Programs, July 2022

I.   PROGRAM DATA

A.   Demand

1.   Headcount and Enrollment

	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024	Change over 3-Year Period
Headcount				
Within the Program	173	301	284	64.2%
Across the Institution	6,653	6,161	6,473	-2.7%
Enrollment				
HCTM-100	8	204	179	2138%
HCTM-110	5	29	30	500%
HCTM-111	--	12	17	N/A
HCTM-112	6	--	12	100%
HCTM-120	109	95	72	-33.9%
HCTM-121	5	--	8	60.0%
HCTM-122	14	--	9	-35.7%
HCTM-125	--	13	--	N/A
HCTM-126	5	--	42	740%
HCTM-190	2	7	6	200%
HCTM-200	38	--	--	-100%
HCTM-201	37	--	--	-100%
HCTM-250	--	12	13	N/A
HCTM-290	--	--	8	N/A
Within the Program	229	372	396	72.9%
Across the Institution	25,216	23,488	24,913	-1.2%
Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review				

RPIE Analysis: *The number of students enrolled (headcount) in the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program increased by 64.2% over the past three years, while headcount across the institution decreased by 2.7%. Enrollment within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program increased by 72.9%, while enrolment across the institution decreased by 1.2% over the same period.*

Enrollment in the following courses changed by more than 10% (±10%) between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024:

> *Courses with enrollment increases:*
> o *HCTM-100 (2138%)*
> o *HCTM-126 (740%)*
> o *HCTM-110 (500%)*
> o *HCTM-190 (200%)*
> o *HCTM-112 (100%)*
> o *HCTM-121 (60.0%)*
>
> *Courses with enrollment decreases:*
> o *HCTM-200 (-100%)*
> o *HCTM-201 (-100%)*
> o *HCTM-122 (-35.7%)*
> o *HCTM-120 (-33.9%)*

The remaining courses reported in the Taxonomy of Programs for Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management (HCTM-124 and all noncredit courses) did not have any enrollments between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024.

Program Reflection:

Overall, there has been a continual increase in all but 5 classes, withing HCTM. HCTM-200, HCTM-201, HOSPNC-600 HOSPNC-601, HOSPNC-602, are all in the discontinuance process in Curriculum Committee. HCTM-200 & 201 were pre-pandemic classes, based on curated material by an outside partner, that is no longer is relevant. HOSPNC-600 HOSPNC-601, HOSPNC-602 were classes offered through the SBDC Center, with their instructors and that program no longer exists on this campus. HCTM-120 and HCTM-122, are both showing increases since this report was run. HCTM-122 Hospitality Law, has not been able to draw enough enrollment to run. But because of its role in the AS-T process, it can not be archived. Students have been able to substitute Busi-103 Business Law, in order to complete their studies. It's a viable and worthwhile substitute.

2. Average Class Size

	2021-2022		2022-2023		2023-2024		Three-Year	
	Sections	Average Size	Sections	Average Size	Sections	Average Size	Average Section Size	Trend
HCTM-100	2	4.0	12	17.0	9	19.9	17.0	397%
HCTM-110	1	5.0	2	14.5	2	15.0	12.8	200%
HCTM-111	--	--	1	12.0	1	17.0	14.5	N/A
HCTM-112	1	6.0	--	--	1	12.0	9.0	100%
HCTM-120	7	15.6	6	15.8	5	14.4	15.3	-7.5%
HCTM-121	1	5.0	--	--	1	8.0	6.5	60.0%
HCTM-122	1	14.0	--	--	1	9.0	11.5	<mark>-35.7%</mark>
HCTM-125	--	--	1	13.0	--	--	13.0	N/A
HCTM-126	1	5.0	--	--	2	21.0	15.7	320%
HCTM-190	1	2.0	1	7.0	3	3.0	3.6	50.0%
HCTM-200	1	38.0	--	--	--	--	38.0	N/A
HCTM-201	1	37.0	--	--	--	--	37.0	N/A
HCTM-250	--	--	1	12.0	1	13.0	12.5	N/A
HCTM-290	--	--	--	--	1	5.0	5.0	N/A
Program Average*	**17**	**13.5**	**24**	**15.5**	**27**	**14.7**	**14.7**	**8.9%**
Institutional Average*	**1,048**	**24.1**	**954**	**24.6**	**986**	**25.3**	**24.6**	**5.0%**

Sources: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review for enrollment data and number of section offerings; Concurrent Section Reports to identify concurrent/cross-listed sections

Average Section Size across the three-year period for courses, and both within academic years and across the three-year period for the program and institutional levels is calculated as:

$$\frac{\text{Total \# Enrollments}}{\text{Total \# Sections}}$$

It is not the average of the three annual averages.

Notes regarding concurrent sections:
- In spring 2024, HCTM-190 and HCTM-290 are reported as one concurrent section.

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program has claimed an average of 14.7 students per section. The average class size in the program is lower than the average class size of 24.6 students per section across the institution during this period. Average class size in the program increased by 8.9% between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024. Average class size at the institutional level increased by 5.0% over the same period.

Average class size in the following courses changed by more than 10% (±10%) between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024:

Courses with increases in average class size:
  o HCTM-100 (397%)
  o HCTM-126 (320%)
  o HCTM-110 (200%)
  o HCTM-112 (100%)
  o HCTM-121 (60.0%)
  o HCTM-190 (50.0%)

Course with a decrease in average class size:
  o HCTM-122 (-35.7%)

Program Reflection:

HCTM is a program broken into 2 different disciplines. Culinary and Hospitality Management. Culinary is limited by the number of students that can be safely accommodated into the Culinary Arts Kitchen. Currently due to kitchen size restrictions and personnel, Culinary classes can only safely have 16 students at a time. These include the following classes:

-HCTM-110
-HCTM-111
-HCTM-112
-HCTM-250

The following classes are lecture based within the Hospitality Management section of the Department and/or are the base class of all HCTM degrees and COA. All of the following classes are currently seeing an increase in enrollment, which will translates into larger average class size. They range from 25 people for Computer Lab class-based classes to the online, asynchronistic classes which accommodate 35pple per section. They are:

-HCTM-100(Can only accommodate 25ppl at a time, due to computer lab class restrictions.)
-HCTM-120: 35pple Online
-HCTM-121: 35pple Online
-HCTM-122: 35pple Online
-HCTM-125: 35pple Online

It's my belief that the future will see positive growth in all of these class, except HCTM-124, which currently can be satisfied by BUSI -103.

3. **Fill Rate and Productivity**

Fill Rate			
	Enrollments	Capacity	Fill Rate
2021-2022	229	553	41.4%
2022-2023	372	664	56.0%
2023-2024	396	875	45.3%
Three-Year Program Total	997	2,092	47.7%
Productivity			
	FTES	FTEF	Productivity
2021-2022	16.8	2.1	8.0
2022-2023	23.7	3.4	7.0
2023-2024	39.4	5.3	7.4
Three-Year Program Total	79.9	10.8	7.4
Sources: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review; SQL Server Reporting Services – Term to Term Enrollment FTES Load Comparison Report (by Credit Course)			

RPIE Analysis: Between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024, the fill rate within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program ranged from 41.4 to 56.0%. [The fill rate has not been calculated at the institutional level.] The program-level rate across the three-year period was 47.7%. Between 2021-2022 and 2022-2023, both enrollment and capacity increased, resulting in an increase in fill rate (due to a higher rate of increase in enrollment). Between 2022-2023 and 2023-2024, both enrollment and capacity increased, resulting in a decrease in fill rate (due to a higher rate of increase in capacity).

Productivity within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program ranged from 7.0 to 8.0 over the past three years. [Productivity has not been calculated at the institutional level.] The three-year productivity of 7.4 is lower than the target level of 17.5, which reflects 1 FTEF (full-time equivalent faculty) accounting for 17.5 FTES (full-time equivalent students) across the academic year. (This target reflects 525 weekly student contact hours for one full-time student across the academic year.)

Program Reflection:

Enrollment is going up continuously. The context for "Fill Rates" may be skewed because we must cap our culinary classes at 16 people, for both instructional and safety issues. We have increased enrollment and offerings in response to industry need, which was cited in the 2023 Workforce Alliance Labor Market Forecast and validated with the institutionalization of the "Wine and Food" pathway at NVC. As for Productivity, the majority of HCTM students are Part-Time and it's a miracle that they are able to stay in school, in general.

4. **Labor Market Demand**

Economic Development Department Standard Occupational Classification Description Codes: 11-9051, 11-9081, 13-1121, 35-1011, 39-6012, and 39-7010	Numeric Change in Employment (Baseline Year to Projected Year)	Projected Growth (% Change in Positions; 2020 Base Employment vs. 2030 Projected Employment)	Projected Number of Positions (Total Job Openings)
Napa County (2020-2030)	450	53.6%	1,690
Bay Area[A] (2020-2030)	9,520	42.8%	40,810
California (2020-2030)	14,800	11.4%	176,090
Source: Economic Development Department Labor Market Information, Long Term Projections (Ten Years), Occupational Projections (http://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov) *[A]Bay Area counties include: Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Solano, and Sonoma. Figures also include San Benito County (reported with projections for Santa Clara County).*			

RPIE Analysis: The figures reported in the table above pertain to the Standard Occupational Classification for the following positions:
- o *Food Service Managers (11-9051)*
- o *Lodging Managers (11-9081)*
- o *Meeting, Convention, and Event Planners (13-1121)*
- o *Chefs and Head Cooks (35-1011)*
- o *Concierges (39-6012)*
- o *Tour and Travel Guides (39-7010)*

The Economic Development Department projects that the number of positions within Napa County will increase by 53.6% (450 positions) between 2020 and 2030. The increase in Napa County exceeds the increases anticipated in the Bay Area and across the state. The number of positions in the Bay Area (not including Napa County) is expected to increase by 42.8% (9,520 positions) between 2020 and 2030.

Program Reflection:

Culinary and Hospitality based jobs are the primary economic driver within the Napa Valley. It's the leading private sector employment sector, which gives our program the best advantage to attract students that want to increase their employment viability and value.

B. Momentum

1. Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates

Course	Rate	Retention Rates (Across Three Years) Course Rate vs. Program Rate Above	Below	Rate	Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years) Course Rate vs. Program Rate Above	Below
HCTM-100	98.7%	--	--	84.1%	*X*	
HCTM-110	93.5%		*X*	85.5%	X	
HCTM-111	92.9%		*X*	85.7%	X	
HCTM-112	100%	X		88.9%	X	
HCTM-120	97.8%	--	--	79.3%	--	--
HCTM-121	92.3%		X	61.5%		X
HCTM-122	100%	X		73.9%		X
HCTM-125	100%	X		84.6%	X	
HCTM-126	95.7%		X	63.8%		*X*
HCTM-190	100%	X		86.7%	X	
HCTM-200	100%	X		60.5%		*X*
HCTM-201	100%	X		51.4%		*X*
HCTM-250	100%	X		96.0%	*X*	
HCTM-290	100%	X		100%	X	
Program Level	98.0%			79.8%		
Institutional Level	**90.9%**			**73.2%**		

Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review
-- Indicates a value that is within 1% of the program-level rate.
Bold italics denote a statistically significant difference between the course-level rate and the program-level rate.
Bold denotes a statistically significant difference between the program-level rate and the institutional rate. The lower of the two rates is highlighted in bold.
Note: Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates.

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, the retention rate for the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program was significantly higher than the retention rate at the institutional level. The retention rates for HCTM-110 and HCTM-111 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. The retention rate for the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program falls within the fourth quartile (Q4) among program-level retention rates (across 60 instructional programs, over the past three years). The retention rate for Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management is among the highest 25% of retention rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the successful course completion rate for the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program was significantly higher the rate at the institutional level. The successful course completion rates for HCTM-126, HCTM-200, and HCTM-201 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. The successful course completion rates for HCTM-100 and HCTM-250 were significantly higher than the program-level rate. The successful course completion rate for Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management falls within the third quartile (Q3) among program-level successful course completion rates (across 60 instructional programs, over the past three years). The successful course completion rate for Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management is among the highest 50% of successful course completion rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the difference between retention and successful course completion at the program level (18.2%) was higher than the difference at the institutional level (17.7%). (The difference was not statistically significant.) This figure represents the proportion of non-passing grades assigned to students at the end of the semester (i.e., grades of D, F, I, NP).

The following Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management courses claimed a difference (between retention and successful course completion) that exceeded the 18.2% difference at the program level:
- *HCTM-201 (48.6%)*
- *HCTM-200 (39.5%)*
- *HCTM-126 (31.9%)*
- *HCTM-121 (30.8%)*
- *HCTM-122 (26.1%)*
- *HCTM-120 (18.5%)*

Program Reflection:

Overall Positive Retention Rates when comparing HCTM at 98.0%, to the Institution level of 90.9%. Again, with Course Completion rates of 79.8% for HCTM and 73.2% College wide.

There will need to be work at improving the Retention and Course Completion rates for HCTM-120, 126, 121, and 122, as has been previously noted.

2. **Student Equity**

	Retention Rates (Across Three Years)		Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years)	
	Program Level	**Institution Level**	**Program Level**	**Institution Level**
Unknown Gender			64.3%	69.3%
19 or Younger			82.7%	*71.1%*
African American/Black			83.0%	*68.2%*
Latinx/Hispanic			80.1%	*69.4%*
First-Generation			76.7%	*69.4%*
Not Disabled			80.0%	*73.0%*
Non-Veteran	98.0%	*90.9%*		

Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review

Bold italics denote a statistically significant difference between rates at the program and institutional levels, with the lower of the two rates in ***bold italics***.

*Data suppressed due to low N (<10 students in cohort).

Notes:

Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates.

The age groupings are based on the student's age of August 15 of each academic year.

The shaded cells in the table do not have data reported because evidence of disproportionate impact was not found at the institutional level (for those demographic group – metric combinations).

RPIE Analysis: This analysis of student equity focuses on the seven demographic groups with significantly lower retention and/or successful course completion rates found at the institutional level (vs. the corresponding rates among all other demographic groups, combined) over the past three years. Tests of statistical significance were conducted to compare program-level and institution-level rates among the seven groups listed above.

Within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program, the retention rate among non-veterans was significantly higher than the rate at the institutional level.

Within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program, the successful course completion rates of students ages 19 and younger, African American/Black students, Latinx/Hispanic students, first-generation students, and students without a disability reported were significantly higher than the corresponding rates at the institutional level.

These finding regarding equity reflect the findings that emerged from the comparison of retention and successful course completion at the program vs. institutional level, where the program-level rates were significantly higher than the institution-level rates. (See Section I.B.1 above.)

Program Reflection:

HCTM Department has been built on a philosophy to have classrooms that are multi-culturally diverse; welcoming to all peoples, of all walks of life, regardless of shape, size, color, and age, while respecting the pronouns of their choice. The statistics reflect the commitment of the HCTM Department to teach with culturally responsive pedagogy. As is shown, HCTM has surpassed all of the institutional level statistics, with the exception being the non-gender category.

This list reflects how much higher HCTM is compared to Campus wide.
Unknown Gender: <5%>
19 or Younger: **+11.6%**
African American/Black: **+14.8%**
Latinx/Hispanic**: +10.7%**
First-Generation: **+7.3%**
Not Disabled: **+7%**
Non-Veteran: **+7.1**

3. **Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates by Delivery Mode (of Courses Taught through Multiple Delivery Modes, i.e., In-Person, Hybrid, and Online)**

	Retention Rates (Across Three Years)			Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years)		
	In-Person	Online	Hybrid	In-Person	Online	Hybrid
In-Person vs. Online						
HCTM-100	99.0%	97.6%		86.6%	*74.7%*	
HCTM-120	98.0%	97.2%		86.8%	*57.7%*	
Program Total						
In-Person vs. Online	98.6%	97.4%		86.7%	*66.9%*	

Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review
This table compares student performance in courses offered through multiple delivery modes within the same academic year.
Bold italics denote a significantly lower rate within that delivery mode.

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, two courses within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program were offered through multiple delivery modes within the same academic year. HCTM-100 and HCTM-120 were offered through online and in-person formats in 2021-2022, 2022-2023, and 2023-2024. This analysis focuses on program-level rates. Details regarding retention and successful course completion rates within individual courses are reported in the table above.

Within the Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program:
- o _The retention rate in online sections was lower than the retention rate in in-person sections. (The difference was not statistically significant.)_
- o _The successful course completion rate in online sections was significantly lower than the successful course completion rate in in-person sections._

Program Reflection:

To meet the enrollment needs of HCTM students, it's been determined that there must be a mixture of in-person and online, asynchronistic classes. Culinary Arts classes need to be taught in-person, just by the shear nature of its skills building being kinesthetic based. While Hospitality Management classes seem to reflect the students' needs for more flexible schedules, to accommodate their jobs, with online, asynchronistic classes.

C. Student Achievement

1. Program Completion

	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024
Degrees	**2**	**1**	**5**
AA Degrees (Culinary)	--	--	3
AS Degrees (Hospitality)	1	--	--
AS-T Degrees (Hospitality	1	1	2
Certificates of Achievement (Hospitality/Culinary)	**2**	**3**	**2**
Institutional: AA Degrees	**83**	**84**	**79**
Institutional: AS Degrees	**306**	**287**	**227**
Institutional: AS-T Degrees	**110**	**111**	**122**
Institutional: Certificates of Achievement	**409**	**384**	**341**
Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2024 Program Review			

RPIE Analysis: The Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program conferred eight degrees between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024. The Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program accounted for 0.6% of the AA, AS, and AS-T degrees conferred by NVC across the three-year period (with 1.2% of AA degrees, 0.1% of AS degrees, and 1.2% of AS-T degrees). Between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024, the number of degrees conferred by the program increased by 150%. During the same period, the number of AA, AS, and AS-T degrees awarded by NVC decreased by 14.2%.

The Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program conferred seven certificates between 2021-2022 and 2023-2024. The Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management Program accounted for 0.6% of certificates conferred by NVC across the three-year period. The program conferred the same number of certificates in 2021-2022 and 2023-2024. During the same period, the number of certificates awarded by NVC decreased by 16.6%.

Program Reflection:

As the two HCTM programs grow, it's hoped that more students will apply for their COA and Degrees. Also to be considered is that many students take culinary arts classes to get work skills, without ever applying for their COA or AA.

2. Program-Set Standards: Job Placement and Licensure Exam Pass Rates

Measure	Program-Set Standard* (& Stretch Goal)	Recent Performance			
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Three-Year Total
Job Placement Rate	60% (80%)	Not reported due to small N (< 10 in each cohort)			82.4%
Licensure Exam Pass Rate	Licensure exams are not required for this program.				
Source: Perkins IV Core 4 Employment data for Program (4-DigitTOP Code: 1307 Hospitality) for job placement rates (https://misweb.cccco.edu/perkins/Core_Indicator_Reports/Summ_CoreIndi_TOPCode.aspx).					

> *RPIE Analysis:* The job placement rate among Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management students was 82.4% over the past three years. This rate exceeds both the program-set standard and the stretch goal. [Job placement rates for individual years are not reported due to the small number of students in recent Hospitality, Culinary & Tourism Management cohorts.]

Program Reflection:

My opinion is that these statistics may not be entirely accurate. By informal surveying, it's been mine and my teams experience that at least 85% to 90% of our students are employed in the restaurant/hospitality industry, before they've even completed the program.

II.   CURRICULUM

A. Courses

Subject	Course Number	Date of Last Review & Approval by the Curriculum Committee *(Courses with last review dates of six years or more must be scheduled for immediate review)*	Has Prerequisite/ Corequisite* Yes/No (Include Date of Last Review)	In Need of Revision *Indicate Non-Substantive (NS) or Substantive (S)* (Include Anticipated Academic Year)	To Be Archived *(as Obsolete, Outdated, or Irrelevant)* (Include Anticipated Academic Year)	No Change
HCTM	100	1/31/2020	No			X
HCTM	110	03/03/2023	Yes			X
HCTM	111	11/03/2023	Yes			X
HCTM	112	11/15/2019	Yes			X
HCTM	120	12/06/2019	No			X
HCTM	121	01/31/2020	No			X
HCTM	122	12/06/2019	No			X
HCTM	124	02/21/2020	Yes			X
HCTM	125	12/06/2019	No			X
HCTM	126	03/03/2023	No			X
HCTM	190	11/17/2023	Yes			X
HCTM	200	01/31/2020	No		X	
HCTM	201	01/31/2020	Yes		X	
HCTM	210	10/10/2023	Yes			X
HCTM	250	03/17/2023	No			X
HCTM	290	11/17/2023	Yes			X
HOSPNC	600	12/14/2017 BOT	No		X	
HOSPNC	601	12/14/2017 BOT	No		X	
HOSPNC	602	12/14/2017 BOT	No		X	

*Note: Prerequisites need to be validated (in subsequent process) through the Curriculum Committee.

Program Reflection:

As stated previously, HCTM-200, 201, HOSPNC-600, 601 and 602 will all be archived.

B. **Degrees and Certificates[+]**

Title of Degree or Certificate	Implementation Date	Required Documentation Complete[++] *Yes/No*	In Need of Revision *and/or Missing Documentation* (Include Anticipated Academic Year)	To Be Archived[*] *(as Obsolete, Outdated, or Irrelevant)* (Include Anticipated Academic Year)	No Change
Culinary Arts-Professional (AA)	Fall 2021	Yes			X
Hospitality Management (AS-T)	Fall 2019	Yes			X
Introductory Basic Culinary Skills (Skills Certificate)		No			X
Intermediate Basic Culinary Skills (Skills Certificate)		No			X
Culinary Arts-Advanced (Certificate of Achievement)	Fall 2021	Yes			X
Hospitality Management (Certificate of Achievement)	Fall 2008	Yes			X

[*]Note: Discontinuance or archival of degrees and certificates must go through the Program Discontinuance process or the Program Archival Task Force.

[+]Degrees and Certificates cannot be implemented until all included required courses in them are approved and active.

[++]Documentation includes Program Narrative and for CTE programs only: Advisory Committee Recommendation, Labor Market Information, and Regional Consortia meeting minutes.

Program Reflection:

HCTM has just the right number of COA's and Degrees. Upcoming as an adjustment, there will be the opportunity for students to apply for a COA or Degree in Culinary Arts, by choosing either HCTM-250 Advanced Culinary 12 credits or HCTM-255 Advanced Baking & Pastry 12 credits, to qualify for completion. This will keep the number pathways in HCTM streamlined.

III. LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

A. Status of Learning Outcomes Assessment

Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Course Level

Number of Courses	Number of Courses with Outcomes Assessed		Proportion of Courses with Outcomes Assessed	
Number of Courses	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years
15	9	13	60%	87%

Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Program/Degree/Certificate Level

Degree/Certificate	Number of Outcomes*	Number of Outcomes Assessed		Proportion of Outcomes Assessed	
		Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years
General PLOs for Program	3	1	3	33%	100%

Program Reflection:

All of HCTM's course level SLO's need to be overhauled. Currently there are too many of them, that aren't consistent through the progression of each program. Reviewing and pairing down the number of SLO's should make the process of yearly review much easier for all the instructors and consistent for the students.

B. Summary of Learning Outcomes Assessment Findings and Actions

Please see note above.

Program Reflection:

Please see note above.

IV. PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTS

The program-level plan that emerged from the last review (fall 2021) included the following initiatives:

- Address impact among disproportionately effected equity groups and their ability to complete their coursework.
- Address the need for increased enrollment.
- Retain students for program completion, so as to increase the number of Degrees and Certificates conferred
- Implement Advanced Culinary Classes at the UVC, so students may procure a Certificate or Associates Degree in Culinary Arts

A. Accomplishments/Achievements Associated with Most Recent Three-Year Program-Level Plan

HCTM has accomplished the following since the last PR in 2021:

*We have increased the number of disproportionately effected equity groups enrolled in our classes. Improvement needed in AA Degree and COA completions.

*Enrollment has increased over the majority of HCTM classes, due to targeted marketing, that needs to continue.

B. Recent Improvements

-2022 saw the first runs of HCTM-190 Culinary Internship and HCTM-250 Advanced Culinary classes. For HCTM-250 it was met with very positive feedback from students, within their evaluation surveys being the data collection point. For HCTM-190, there is continued growth in professional partnerships with employers, because of the positive experiences they have had in employing our students.

C. Effective Practices

To continue to promote collectively, a positive teaching environment, that allows students from many paths, to pursue their goals of learning professional culinary arts. Everyone that works in the HCTM Department will demonstrate their commitment to diversity, equity, inclusion and the ability of our students to be able to afford their tuition for school.

COA- Cost Tuition Culinary Arts: 2024-2025 School Year

	Per Credit Cost	Student Fees			
HCTM-100	$ 96.00	$ 90.00			
HCTM-110	$ 144.00	$ 175.00			
HCTM-111	$ 144.00	$ 175.00			
HCTM-112	$ 144.00	$ 175.00			
HCTM-190	$ 144.00	$ -			
HCTM-250	$ 576.00	$ 900.00			
HCTM-290	$ 144.00	$ -			
	$ 1,392.00	$ 1,515.00			
Grand Total New Cost	**$ 2,907.00**			**Old NVCS**	**$ 20,000.00**
			14.54%		
		Difference	**85.465%**		

COA-Cost Tuition Hospitality Management: 2024-2025 School Year

		Per Credit Cost	Student Fees		
	HCTM-100	$ 96.00	$ 90.00		
	HCTM-110	$ 144.00	$ 175.00		
	HCTM-120	$ 144.00	$ 75.00		
	HCTM-124	$ 144.00	$ 75.00		
HCTM-122 or HCTM-125		$ 144.00	$ 75.00		
		$ 672.00	$ 490.00		
		Grand Total Cost	**$ 1,162.00**		

PROGRAM PLAN

A. Based on the information included in this document, the program is described as being in a state of:

__ Viability

__ Stability

_X_ Growth

*Please select ONE of the above.

Explain why you selected that description of the state of the program.

-72.9% Increase in Program Enrollment (classes taken). In context this works out to be 64.2% increase in actual headcount.

B. Outline the three-year plan for the program by completing Columns A – D of the Three-Year Program Planning Template (the Excel file that will accompany the Program Review Report). For the fall 2024 program review cycle, the 3-year program plan will span 2025-2026 through 2027-2028.

V. RESOURCES NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT PROGRAM PLAN

A. Describe the current state of program resources relative to the plan outlined above. (Resources include: personnel, technology, equipment, facilities, operating budget, training, and library/learning materials.) Identify any anticipated resource needs (beyond the current levels) necessary to implement the plan outlined above.

Description of Current Program Resources Relative to Plan:

> The state of the program is that we have approximately 80% of the equipment needed to run current class; in a single classroom that is difficult to teach in, due to sight, safety, plumbing and electrical issues. When HCTM-250 runs again, we won't have enough equipment, nor is their a current home kitchen-classroom to teach in. When HCTM-255 Adv. B&P runs, there will also be additional specialty equipment needs, such as a bread deck-oven and that this need may be addressed when HCTM-250 finds a new home.

B. Identify the resources needed in order to implement each component of the three-year plan for the program by completing Columns E – F of the Three-Year Program Planning Template (the Excel file that will accompany the Program Review Report). If more than one type of resource (e.g., operating expenses, technology, supplies, facilities, equipment, etc.) is needed to implement the initiative, list each need on consecutive rows following the unit-level initiative.

Note: Resources to support program plans are allocated through the annual planning and resource allocation process (not the program review process).

The completed Three-Year Program Planning Template will serve as a draft/starting point for upcoming annual planning and resource allocation cycles.

	A	B	C	D	E	F
	PROGRAM:	<mark>*HCTM*</mark>				
	PLANNING YEARS:	**2025-2026 through 2027-2028**				
	Program/Service	**Unit-Level Initiative**	**Anticipated Year of Implementation**	**Anticipated Outcome of Initiative**	**Description of Resource Need**	**Type of Resource Need**
	HCTM Culinary Arts Program (NEW) facility.	Urgent need for new teaching kitchen space to accommodate program growth, align with industry standards, and meet student need.	2024-2025 (Current)	HCTM 250 and the launch of HCTM 255 were postponed due to lack of appropiate facility. New accomodations need to be in place by Fall 2025 and options are currenlty being explored.	There is potential of a shared space with industry partners but we anticipte the need to invest in a short to long term lease agreement and or modular kitchen to be installed at NVC.	Facilities
	HCTM Culinary Arts Program (UPGRADE) facility.	As the only existing teaching space is the 900 kitchen on campus, maintenance, cleanliness, safety, and compliance are essential. There are current plumbing and line of sight issues that should be addressed asap. Should there be another pest outbreak for safety reasons we would be forced to suspend the program.	2024-2025 (Current)	The expected outcome would be a suitable kitchen for entry level courses that creates a pipeline into advanced coursework (HCTM 250 and 255) and is essential to program viability.	To date, both SWP and Perkins funds have helped offset ongoing facility maintenance funds as well as Belle Rhodes endowment funds. The specific current needs are plumbing, electrical, and revamping line of sight for both instrution and safety as this space was not built as a teaching kitchen.	Facilities
	HCTM Culinary Arts Staffing	There are safety concerns that require a dedicated Instructional Assistant. There have been stop gap measures with DAS staff to help but a permanent assignment is needed. Incidents of student injury in Spring of 2024 highlights this need. As the program expands there will also be need for another full-time faculty member to avoid ongoing overload issues and meet student and industy need.	2025-2026	Staffing of an Instructional Aid and new Full-Time faculty member will greatly help meet industry needs and, support our larger CCAP offerings, and continue to train and advance our students.	Resources for salaries associated with postions.	Staffing

HOSPITALITY, CULINARY & TOURISM MANAFEMENT   FALL 2024

Completed by Supervising Administrator:

Douglas C. Marriott

Date:

November 18, 2024

Strengths and successes of the program, as evidenced by analysis of data, outcomes assessment, and curriculum:

Strengths are well documented in this analysis and demonstrated by the increased enrollment. This program is instrumental in our "Wine and Food" Pathway at NVC, our CCAP partnerships, and to meeting industry needs in the Napa Valley. We have worked to creatively support the program and align it with the new pathway, as demonstrated by the hiring of Manager of Winery, Hospitality, and Culinary operations in 2024. In the spring of 2024 the "restaurant" culmination for the Advanced Culinary course was done in the Community Room on our main campus and attended by many partners and community members (including the Chancellor's Office for the California Community Colleges) which helped promote the program. In the Fall of 2024 we launched a Winery Hospitality Course through community services which was filled to capacity at 35 students. We intend to put this through curriculum to offer it to benefit both HCTM and VWT students to continue program alignment. When compared to private, for profit, culinary options in Napa our HCTM program stands out as accessible, affordable, and impactful in my view. I credit the dedicated faculty and NVC team members for this work and also appreciate that it is common practice for this department to have two Industry Advisory Board meetings per year to listen to partners and to promote the work on behalf of the students we are serving.

Areas of concern, if any:

The main area of concern is adequate facilities for this program, as is cited in this review. A task force has been formed and is looking into many options and partnerships to meet this challenge. I am confident a solution will be found and know the more we partner with industry and our community the better for the program.

Recommendations for improvement:

Summer offerings to build the pipeline for the program as well as exploration of a "boot camp" model for our community to have them advance and complete more quickly.

Additional information regarding resources:

I appreciated the citation of the CTE Outcomes Survey as well as LMI regarding this industry and know that this program will continue to grow to meet the needs our students and industry partners despite the real facilities issues that have impacted it over the past three years.